

Arts and Culture Advisory Group

Proposed key measures • Other context measures • Measures not included • Additional feedback

Arts and Culture Section Goal: All Minnesotans have opportunities to experience and create arts and culture, enriching the vitality of our state.

PROPOSED KEY MEASURES

Name of measure

1) Arts and culture attendance

Percentage of residents attending arts and culture events and institutions in the past year

Reasons for inclusion and data availability

Arts and culture attendance is one measure of **community participation in the arts** Advisory group members were interested in tracking attendance in different arts and culture "buckets" (see list below).

Advisory group feedback: Measures that increase understanding of which communities in Minnesota **attend arts and culture events and institutions** and whether these communities reflect the demographics of our state.

Data are available every 2-4 years for the nation, state, Twin Cities area; data available by arts and culture event type, race/ethnicity, gender, age, income, and education level. (Source: Current Population Survey, Annual Arts Benchmarking Survey, and Survey of Public Participation in the Arts)

Arts and culture activities include:

- Performing Arts: e.g., Live music, dance, theater performances
- Visual Arts: e.g., Visiting an art exhibit, museum or gallery, visual art festival, craft fair, art exhibit
- *Historical:* e.g., Visiting a historic park or monument
- Literary: e.g., Live book readings, poetry, or storytelling

2) Youth arts participation

Percentage of residents with school-aged children whose children attended an arts and culture class or activity in the past year Youth exposure to arts and culture is one measure of **youth access to arts- and culture-related education opportunities** that advisory group members were interested in tracking.

Advisory group feedback: Measures that lend insight into **art education opportunities for youth in our state**, including how much youth are exposed to the arts during school and outside of school.

Data are available every 2-4 years for the nation, state, and Twin Cities; data are available by parent income and education level. (Source: Current Population Survey, Survey of Public Participation in the Arts)

Arts and culture activities include attending an art or music class (at school or outside school), gallery, museum, or live performance.

			-				
N I	am	_	~ #	100	~~	\sim	
-1/1		$\boldsymbol{\mu}$			μ_{λ}	S.I.	пρ

Reasons for inclusion and data availability

3) Creating or performing art

Percentage of residents creating or performing arts in past year Advisory group feedback: Measures that identify "Who are artists in Minnesota?" and "How are different communities engaging in the arts?" Proposed measure will characterize all residents who create or perform in arts and culture.

Data are available every 2-4 years for the nation, state, and Twin Cities area; data available by artistic discipline, gender, race/ethnicity, age, education level, income, and artistic profession (i.e., employed in the arts sector). (Source: Current Population Survey, Annual Arts Benchmarking Survey and Survey of Public Participation in the Arts)

OTHER PROPOSED ARTS AND CULTURE CONTEXT MEASURE

Name of measure

How it helps or provides context

Arts and culture workforce

Demographic summary of Minnesota residents who identify having an arts and culture occupation Advisory group feedback: Measures that identify "Who are artists in Minnesota?" This proposed contextual measure will identify residents who state an arts-related occupation as their primary or secondary occupation.

• Data is available annually for the nation, state, counties, and cities in Minnesota; and by gender, race/ethnicity, age, disability status, educational attainment, poverty level, employment status, health insurance status, and artistic discipline. (Source: American Community Survey)

February 2017 Page 2 of 10

MEASURES NOT INCLUDED

Suggested measure	Captured in proposed measures	Data unavailable or unreliable	Does not meet Compass criteria	Different measures rose to the top	Notes
Artists					
Density of artists			X		Descriptive rather than outcome oriented
Percentage of artists accessing social services (e.g., housing, transportation)	X		X		Proposed measures will identify the number of artists accessing public assistance programs, including WIC, supplemental nutrition programs, and welfare; however, data sources related to housing, transportation, and credit are not available
Barriers to participating in the arts			X		Descriptive rather than outcome oriented
Quantity and type of art being produced	X	X		X	Proposed contextual measure provides the number of residents creating art by type, serving as a proxy for the quantity of art being produced
Percentage of art that is social change art		X			No population-level data source available that provides a valid, consistent comparable measure
Origin of art created in Minnesota	X	X			Proposed contextual measure provides the number of residents creating art by type in greater Minnesota and Twin Cities area
Percentage of safe spaces for artists to create art		X			No population-level data source available that provides a valid, consistent comparable measure
Arts organizations					
Number of arts and arts- supporting organizations			X		Descriptive and input oriented rather than outcome oriented
Financial health of arts organizations			X		Descriptive and input oriented rather than outcome oriented

February 2017 Page 3 of 10

Suggested measure	Captured in proposed measures	Data unavailable or unreliable	Does not meet Compass criteria	Different measures rose to the top	Notes
Number of arts organizations serving underserved populations			X		Descriptive and input oriented rather than outcome oriented
Number of arts venues available to the public			X		Descriptive and input oriented rather than outcome oriented
Arts funding					
Number of and type/characteristics of groups receiving arts funding		X	X		Although tracking equity in arts funding rose to the top of desired measures in the advisory group, there is no consistent, comprehensive, or comparable source of all private, public, and
Number of organizations providing funding by type and characteristics of groups receiving arts funding		X	X		philanthropic funding grants provided, received, or earmarked available for specific groups. Unfortunately, the cost to assemble a complete data source with all funding grants received and provided exceeds our budget (see final page for additional suggestions
Number of funding opportunities set aside or earmarked for specific groups		X	X		 moving forward). Compass also defines funding as input-oriented, rather than outcome-oriented, and it does not meet our measure criteria.
Public participation in the arts	S				
Percentage of residents buying art				X	Buying art was not rigorously emphasized in the advisory group
Reasons why residents participate in arts and culture		X	X		Descriptive rather than outcome oriented
Percentage of residents who believe arts and culture benefit the community		X		X	Perception of how arts and culture benefit communities was not rigorously emphasized in the advisory group; existing data source provides limited demographic breakdowns and cannot be compared nationally or to other metropolitan areas

February 2017 Page 4 of 10

Suggested measure	Captured in proposed measures	Data unavailable or unreliable	Does not meet Compass criteria	Different measures rose to the top	Notes
Percentage of residents who believe they are able to easily access arts and culture		X		X	Existing data source provides limited demographic breakdowns and cannot be compared nationally or to other metropolitan areas
Impact of the arts on economy, health, and education					
Number of arts-related jobs	X		X	X	Proposed contextual measure allows summary of related demographic characteristics of artists which was emphasized by the advisory group; descriptive rather than outcome oriented
Impact of arts on tourism dollars		X		X	The theme of equitable access to the arts was emphasized more prominently than financial impact of the arts in the advisory group; other organizations and groups in Minnesota are currently focusing on tracking financial impact of the arts and culture industry
Number of arts-related intellectual property licensing			X		Input rather than outcome oriented
Impact of arts sector on helping to recruit employees to Minnesota		X			Challenging to develop a consistent and comparable measure within the allotted time frame and no current data source is available
Impact of arts sector on economic development		X			Challenging to develop a consistent and comparable measure within the allotted time frame and no current data source is available
Size and health of the arts sector			X	X	Participation and engagement in the arts was emphasized more prominently than the size of the arts economy in the advisory group; other organizations and groups in Minnesota are currently focusing on tracking financial impact of the arts and culture industry
Impact of art on social justice		X			Difficult to assemble a consistent, comparable measure that reliably operationalizes "social justice" and can determine impact of art

February 2017 Page 5 of 10

Suggested measure	Captured in proposed measures	Data unavailable or unreliable	Does not meet Compass criteria	Different measures rose to the top	Notes
Artistic contribution to civic initiatives		X			Difficult to assemble a consistent, comparable measure that reliably operationalizes "artistic contribution"
Arts impact on identity formation (e.g., pride in cultural traditions)		X			Difficult to assemble a consistent, comparable measure that reliably operationalizes "identity formation" and also determines the impact of art at the community level; no current data source is available
Impact of arts on mental and physical health		X			Difficult to assemble a comparable, consistent measure assessing the impact of art across health and mental health conditions at the community level; no current data source is available
Impact of arts on education outcomes (e.g., early childhood education, closing the achievement gap)		X			Difficult to assemble a comparable, consistent measure assessing the impact of art on educational outcomes at the community level
Arts education					
Number of teachers in the arts			X		Input rather than outcome oriented
Number of STEM vs. STEAM schools			X		Input rather than outcome oriented
Impact of arts education on future careers		X			Difficult to assemble a comparable, consistent measure assessing the impact of arts on educational outcomes at the community level
Additional equity measures					
Different ways that communities value arts and culture		X	X		A valid, reliable population-level measure is not available; descriptive rather than outcome oriented
Density and location of arts organizations in Minnesota			X		Descriptive rather than outcome oriented; data available for few and inconsistent geography levels

February 2017 Page 6 of 10

Suggested measure	Captured in proposed measures	Data unavailable or unreliable	Does not meet Compass criteria	Different measures rose to the top	Notes
Number of arts and cultural organizations with leaders of color		X	X		Publicly available data sources with the demographic characteristics of all arts and cultural organization leaders and boards in Minnesota are not available
Other measures					
Relational aspects of the arts across arts, health, economic development, education, and transportation		X	X		Difficult to assemble a valid measure of "relational," not outcome oriented
Characteristics of the environment in which artist organizations can thrive			X		Descriptive rather than outcome oriented
Diverse stories			X		Descriptive rather than outcome oriented
Relevance of arts and culture to communities		X			No population-level data source available that provides a valid, consistent comparable measure
Healing		X			No population-level data source available that provides a valid, consistent comparable measure
Dreams		X			No population-level data source available that provides a valid, consistent comparable measure
Aesthetics		X			No population-level data source available that provides a valid, consistent comparable measure
Leaders understand the many ways to define art		X			No population-level data source available that provides a valid, consistent comparable measure

February 2017 Page 7 of 10

ADDITIONAL FEEDBACK

	Questions and suggestions	Comments
1)	Can artists play a role in visualizing the data?	Minnesota Compass uses a software program to produce standardized data visualizations across the site. This provides a standard experience for the user and allows them to easily view, navigate, and interpret data. That said, we love this idea!
		Moving forward : All Compass data is available to download for use by the public. Artists are welcome to download the data and develop artistic visualizations. We welcome your suggestions about how we can facilitate this process. For example, we could develop "data visualization" contests that will engage artists to work with us to create artistic visualizations of the data.
2)	How will arts and culture be	We understand that the definition of arts and culture is broad and may vary across communities and individuals.
	defined?	Moving forward : "Arts" will be defined based on how the data source defined and collected information about arts and culture. We will aim to be as inclusive as possible and will consult advisors as needed.
3)	How can equity in arts funding be tracked?	Although tracking equity in arts funding rose to the top of desired measures in the advisory group, there is no consistent, comprehensive, or complete source of all private, public, and philanthropic funding grants provided, received, or earmarked for specific groups.
		Moving forward : Primary data collection would give us the opportunity to collect information on the specific questions we have about arts funding in Minnesota and our local communities. Unfortunately, we are confronted with the issue of affordability. Our Minnesota Compass team welcomes the opportunity to meet with your organization to discuss opportunities and costs associated with primary data collection.
4)	Is it possible to disaggregate data for people of color?	The race and ethnicity categories that will be used in the key measure analysis are the standard categories used by the U.S. Census Bureau, American Community Survey, and Current Population Survey. Minnesota Compass makes an effort to disaggregate data when the data methodology allows for reliable estimates and confidence that individuals will not be identified. Due to small sample sizes for some data, we are unable to disaggregate data for people of color for all proposed indicators.
		Moving forward: The most detailed and reliable race and ethnicity data available will be presented if estimates are reliable. There are limitations in the degree to which race and ethnicity data can be disaggregated while still providing reliable estimates for some geographies. The Current Population Survey, Annual Arts Benchmarking Survey, and Survey of Public Participation in the Arts, the primary data sources used for the proposed measures, reliably provide estimates for people of color statewide and for the Twin Cities. The American Community Survey, the data source used for the proposed contextual measure, provides reliable estimates statewide and for the Twin Cities area.
		Please note as a separate component to this section, we are in the process of developing detailed profiles for racial/ethnic groups that will disaggregate data for people of color for many of our Key Measures.

February 2017 Page 8 of 10

	Questions and suggestions	Comments					
5)	How can you capture all artists who are employed? Not all artists are full-time artists and we don't put "artist" on our tax forms.	The American Community Survey collects information from Minnesota residents who identify artist as their occupation and indicate their employment status as an artist. This data source also asks artists to indicate whether they are working, full-time, part-time, and if they are self-employed.					
	on our tax rorms.	Moving forward : All employment and status types will be incorporated into the proposed contextual measure describing artists.					
6)	How do you know how many artists are out there? Is there a census of artists?	The American Community Survey collects information from Minnesota residents who identify artist as their occupation and indicate their employment status as an artist. The Survey of Public Participation in the Arts collects information about all residents in Minnesota who have engaged in art by creating or performing art.					
-		Moving forward: Data from these sources will be used for our Key Measures.					
7)	Can we tell stories beyond the data?	Our Minnesota Compass library is a key resource for publications that examine these issues in greater depth.					
		Moving forward : If you have suggestions for materials to add to our Arts and Culture library on Minnesota Compass, please feel free to pass them along to library@wilder.org .					

February 2017

Page 9 of 10



Measuring progress. Inspiring action.

mncompass.org

For more information:

Ellen Wolter, Minnesota Compass ellen.wolter@wilder.org

 $Craig\ Helmstetter,\ Minnesota\ Compass\ \underline{craig.helmstetter@wilder.org}$

Minnesota Compass is led by Wilder Research on behalf of a collaborative of foundations.

February 2017 Page 10 of 10